



## SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

### PART 1:

|                          |                                                                        |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE &amp; Health</a> |
| Manuscript Number:       | 2014_IJTDH_9911                                                        |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Placental Malaria and Its Associations with Pregnancy Outcome          |
|                          | Original Research Article                                              |

### PART 2:

| FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Authors' response to final evaluator's comments                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>The manuscript has been slightly improved, however there are still major flaws that persist.</p> <p>1/ I am very surprised by the prevalence of placental malaria of 70.5%, as such high prevalence has NEVER been reported previously. (Unfortunately, reference 10 cannot be retrieved in pubmed) In addition, surprisingly this very rate of infection is not paralleled by such high rate of occurrence of several outcomes (maternal anemia, LBW...) that are within the usual range encountered in Africa. The authors should present data on active infection and passive infection, and reassure the reader that histology has been adequately performed, as it is very easy to not distinguish malaria pigment deposition from various artefacts (such as formalin or stain inclusions). Obviously, a comparison of the data with those from placental blood smear would be very helpful. Without this, the data remain questionable.</p> <p>2/ The full analysis should be conducted in separate groups (active – passive infection) as the effects may differ.</p> <p>3/ The authors report an increase risk of several poor outcomes (maternal anemia, preterm delivery, LBW...) in case of placental infection. The OR are going with very wide confidence intervals and are presented as crude non-adjusted OR. The analysis should have been adjusted on potentially confounding variables (such as age, parity, GA...). In the absence of multivariate analysis, it is not possible to be confident in the relationships demonstrated.</p> <p>I also have less major comments:</p> <p>1/ The introduction states that placental malaria "causes damage to the placental vessels and a compromise on the perfusion (l 64-5). This is not true, and certainly not stated in the reference 6 (which is not related to this topic), as claimed by the authors.</p> <p>2/ The text of the result section is still highly redundant with the tables. Please consider revising.</p> <p>3/The manuscript is still very poorly written, and not suitable for publication.</p> <p>4/ Names of the authors (both in the text and in the reference section) are misspelled (ref 15 and line 183) or changed to their first names (ref 6 or 13, for example). This is unacceptable.</p> <p>Overall, it is not sufficient for the authors to write they have made changes, they should do it !</p> | <p><b>1. The reference no. 10 has been replaced to the one you can access in pubmed. The prevalence could not parallel with maternal anaemia and LBW because we excluded some factors that cause them eg sickle cell anaemia, antepartum haemorrhage, preeclampsia/eclampsia.</b></p> <p><b>The data was not collected as active or passive infection form, rather it was collected in the form of positive or negative format as stressed in the methodology.</b></p> <p><b>The samples were kept in neutral buffer formalin which helped to maintain them in neutral pH to avoid pigment artefacts and this is the standard.</b></p> <p><b>There are limited studies in placental malaria using histology, so we don't have many options. Still we compared with some of the placental malaria that used histology.</b></p> <p><b>2. The aim of this study is not to find whether past or present infection is responsible for poor pregnancy outcome. Other studies should be structured to answer the question.</b></p> <p><b>3. This was stated as one of the limitations of this study -</b> The study could not demonstrate that these associations were the effects of placental malaria, as it could not exclude all the possible causes of these adverse effects. So this study admitted that there some confounding factors.</p> <p>1. This has been replaced with another reference.</p> <p>2. Other reviewers demanded for the tables, but indicate the one you want changed, we will do it.</p> <p>4. Menendex has been spelt correctly.</p> <p>Thanks for your corrections.</p> |